Advancing Equity with Solidarity in Mind

A Community event, hosted by SESECC

DATE: September 28, 2017
PRESENTER: john a. powell, Director Haas Institute
AUTHORIAL SUPPORT: Alyson Reimer, Haas Institute
How many of you have dreamed that you could fly?

Were you human, or, were you an animal?

How many of you have dreamed that you were of a different gender?

What about race?
Who is in the circle of human concern?
Steps to create a learning community:

1. VOICE
Participate fully but evenly. Respect confidentiality.

2. EARS
Listen for deep understanding and respect.

3. EYES
See others’ viewpoints. Use ‘I’ statements.

4. MIND
Be fully present and open to new learning.

5. HEART
Speak from it. Express your core values.
The problem of “Othering” is the problem of the 21st century.
Othering is a set of processes, structures, and dynamics that engender marginality and persistent inequality across any of the full range of human differences. Othering and marginality can occur on a group basis or at the individual level.

Dimensions include but are not limited to,

- race
- religion
- gender
- ability
- sexuality
- age
- ethnicity
- class
- skin tone
As diversity grows in the United States...

50 years of Loving
United States, interracial and inter-ethnic marriages, as % of total

- Other interracial marriage
- Non-white Hispanic – white
- Mixed-race – white
- Black – white
- Asian – white
- White Hispanic – white

Sources: Census; IPUMS USA; The Economist
As diversity grows...so does anxiety and racial resentment...
INCREASE IN DIVERSITY

INCREASE IN ANXIETY

LOOK TO LEADERSHIP TO SET META-NARRATIVE THAT...

1. BRIDGE COMMUNITIES
   - EMPATHY
   - INCLUSION
   - BELONGING

2. BREAK COMMUNITIES
   - FEAR
   - ANGER
   - OTHERING
BREAKING
When a group turns inwards and explicitly pushes away from other groups who are seen as dangerous or a threat.

BONDING
Connecting to individuals who are similar to you in some important way.

BRIDGING
Ties to people who are unlike you in some important way through stories, structures, and contact.
The new breaking narrative of leadership:

TRUMP’S MESSAGE TO BLACK VOTERS, AUGUST 2016

PREPARED STATEMENT

Look at how much African-American communities have suffered under Democratic Control. To those hurting, I say: what do you have to lose by trying something new?

ACTUAL STATEMENT

You’re living in your poverty, your schools are no good, you have no jobs, 58 percent of your (black) youth is unemployed — what the hell do you have to lose?

JEREMY STAHL, TRUMP TO BLACK VOTERS: YOU’RE POOR, SO VOTE FOR ME, AUGUST 19, 2016
What’s happening right now in Seattle?

We have a new mayor, Tim Burgess, for at least the next 70 days. *How should this time be used?*

New Leadership = New Narrative?
Our Values

- All men are created equal
- With liberty and justice for all
- Government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth
- One person, one vote
Our Reality

**HOW TO STEAL AN ELECTION**

- **50 PRECINCTS**
  - 60% BLUE
  - 40% RED

- **5 DISTRICTS**
  - 5 BLUE
  - 0 RED
  - BLUE WINS

- **5 DISTRICTS**
  - 3 RED
  - 2 BLUE
  - RED WINS

---

**Corporations**

**We the People**

---

**NEW VOTER ID LAWS**

**ENTER HERE**
The Fundamental Emergent Questions

4 fundamental questions:

1. What’s the state of reality?

2. What’s causing that reality?

3. Where to intervene in that reality?

4. How to make the structural and behavioral changes?
How does who you are shape what you know and think about the world?
We have many different ways of being.

Our identities are multiple and malleable.
How much do we, (our or our identities), change over time?

In a study of over 19,000 people ages 18 to 68, participants were asked about their personality traits and preferences – their favorite foods, vacations, hobbies, music – in years past and present, and then were asked to make predictions for what their personalities and tastes would be like in 10 years.

The results?

People of all ages consistently underestimate the potential changes ahead.

Psychologists call this phenomenon the “end of history illusion.”

The “end of history” illusion

Why does this illusion exist and persist? Dr. Jordi Quoidbach of Harvard offers a few reasons:

• “The ‘I wish I knew then what I know now’ experience might give us a sense of satisfaction and meaning, whereas realizing how transient our preferences and values are might lead us to doubt every decision and generate anxiety.”

• “People may confuse the difficulty of imagining personal change with the unlikelihood of change itself.”
There IS hope for the future

Why does this matter?

This matters, in part, because we resist change and even the idea of change when we cannot imagine what that change would look like or entail.

This also matters because it indicates that the better we are able to imagine positive changes in ourselves, our communities, and our world, the less we will resist change and stay rooted in our current (problematic, outdated, uninformed, etc.) identities.
There is no such thing as a single-issue struggle because we do not live single-issue lives.

Audre Lorde
What is intersectionality?

A term coined by Dr. Kimberle Crenshaw, intersectionality is a theory of oppression.

Intersectionality describes the ways in which oppressive institutions (racism, sexism, homophobia, transphobia, xenophobia, classism, etc.) are interconnected and cannot be examined separately from one another.

Intersectionality challenges the very foundations and structures of our society, demanding profound transformation.
Why is intersectionality important?

Because.....

- Existing systems and structures can work together to erase or omit intersectional identities.

- Centering the experiences of privileged identities within oppressed groups further marginalizes those who exist at the intersection of marginalized identities.
  
  e.g., focusing on race privilege (i.e. white) within feminist discourse, and sex privilege (i.e. hetero male) within antiracist discourse, centers privileged identities.

- Intersectional experience is greater than the sum of its parts.

Special Credit to Perfecta Oxholm, PhD Candidate at the Goldman School of Public Policy.

https://gspp.berkeley.edu/directories/phd-students/perfecta-oxholm
What happens when…

…we don’t focus on intersectionality

• We fail to understand how oppression is operating.
• We recreate and reify existing systems of oppression.
• We fail at achieving transformative change.

…we do focus on intersectionality

• We understand how oppression operates and looks different for those at the intersection of marginalized identities.
• We disrupt current systems of oppression.
• We develop better coalitions for liberation.

Special Credit to Perfecta Oxholm,
PhD Candidate Goldman School of Public Policy
https://gspp.berkeley.edu/directories/phd-students/perfecta-oxholm
Positionality refers to both the fact of and the specific conditions of a given social situation.

Where one might talk about the “position” of an individual in a social structure, “positionality” draws attention to the conditions under which such a position arises, the factors that stabilize that position, and the particular implications of that position with reference to the forces that maintain it.
What are the structural barriers to addressing the unique discrimination of groups with intersectional identities?

How could policy address this unique discrimination?
Understanding Structures as Systems

We are all situated within structures, but not evenly. Structures interact in a way that produces a differential in outcome. Structures unevenly distribute benefits and burdens to various groups. Institutions can operate jointly to produce negative outcomes.
Introducing Systems Thinking

We need to think about the ways in which the institutions that mediate opportunity are arranged – systems thinking.

The Newtonian Perspective:

Social phenomena may be understood by breaking down the sum of the constituent parts.

Systems Thinking:

Causation is reciprocal, mutual, and cumulative.
Introducing Systems Thinking, continued.

Example: A bird in a cage

Examining one wire cannot explain why a bird cannot fly.

But multiple wires, arranged in specific ways, reinforce each other and trap the bird.
Complex Adaptive System

1. These system are resistant to transformative change.
2. Systems are emergent
3. They adapt to interventions
4. Change is not best through holistic approach.
5. Instead for leverage point or strategic intervention
Moving towards structural inclusion

**SEPARATION**
Stairs do not work for people in wheelchairs.

**PERMEABLE**
Steps advantage some and disadvantage others.

**CONNECTION**
Acknowledging different groups’ needs results in unexpected benefits for the whole community.

We need to create structures and policies that bridge instead of break.
Structural inclusion means to belong

**Belonging** connotes something fundamental about both how groups are structurally positioned within society as well as how they are perceived and regarded.

**EXCLUSION**

**INTEGRATION**

**INCLUSION**
Structural inequity is a form of othering: it produces consistently different outcomes for different communities.

Targeted universalism highlights pathways different groups face and suggests structural changes to make those paths smoother.
Why targeted universalism?
CONCEPT VIDEO
## What level does your TU goal address?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Possible Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INDIVIDUAL</strong></td>
<td>Individuals sign loan documents that they don’t understand</td>
<td>Borrower education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INSTITUTIONAL</strong></td>
<td>A particular bank won’t make loans in historically redlined neighborhoods</td>
<td>Organize local, regional or state action, file a lawsuit, etc. to force that particular bank to change its lending practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>STRUCTURAL</strong></td>
<td>All of the major leaders in the area have stopped giving loans or will only give subprime loans in historically redlined neighborhoods</td>
<td>Collaborate with national alliances working to increase and enforce fair lending practices, community reinvestment act, etc. through community organizing and advocacy at the state and national level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GLOBAL</strong></td>
<td>Loans are no longer held by local or even national banks, but are owned by foreign governments</td>
<td>Work with national and transnational organizations to increase regulation of multinational corporations, and reduce regulation of transnational population migration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5 steps to targeted universalism — it takes a village!

1. To “do” targeted universalism—to realize the potential of an equity analysis—requires cooperation and collaboration:

2. Articulate a particular goal based upon a robust understanding and analysis of the problem at hand.

3. Assess difference of general population from universal goal.

4. Assess the divergence of particular geographies and population segments from goal.

5. Assess barriers to achieving the goal for each group/geography.

6. Craft targeted processes to each group to reach universal goal.
Applying targeted universalism in education

UNIVERSAL GOAL
Joyful and meaningful education for all children

STUDENT GROUP
Middle-class children of all races

TARGETED STRATEGY
Students ready for school and school ready for students.

1. Provide resources and support to cultivate, retain, and nurture good students and teachers.
Applying targeted universalism in education

UNIVERSAL GOAL
Joyful and meaningful education for all children

STUDENT GROUP
Low socioeconomic status children

TARGETED STRATEGY
Students ready for school and school ready for students.

1. Provide resources and support to cultivate, retain, and nurture good students and teachers.
2. Provide nutritious meals, stable housing, and medical care.
Applying targeted universalism in education

UNIVERSAL GOAL
Joyful and meaningful education for all children

STUDENT GROUP
African American children

TARGETED STRATEGY
Students ready for school and school ready for students.

1. Provide resources and support to cultivate, retain, and nurture good students and teachers.
2. Provide nutritious meals, stable housing, and medical care.
3. Curriculum and pedagogical approaches for teachers, administrators, and students that counter unconscious impact of pervasive negative stereotypes.
Applying targeted universalism in education

UNIVERSAL GOAL
Joyful and meaningful education for all children

STUDENT GROUP
Recent immigrant children

TARGETED STRATEGY
Students ready for school and school ready for students.

1. Provide and support to cultivate, retain, and nurture good students and teachers.
2. Provide nutritious meals, stable housing, and medical care
3. Curriculum and pedagogical approaches for teachers, administrators, and students that counter unconscious impact of pervasive negative stereotypes.
4. Provide English language and first language supports, as well as interpretation and outreach in parent’s first language.
“I just started questioning everything: Am I supposed to be here? Am I good enough?”

PROFILE — VANESSA B. AT UT AUSTIN
- From a low-income family
- First-generation college student
- Top 7% of her high school class
  - Top 10 percent law in Texas
- Failed her first college exam in statistics, a prerequisite for admission to the nursing program

Why didn’t Vanessa excel like her high school record suggest?
WHAT MAKES STUDENTS SUCCESSFUL?

- Quality of high school education
- Availability of college
- Family support system
- Resources

“The UT experiment reminds us that the process of giving working-class teenagers the tools to become successful professionals isn’t easy; it never has been. But it also reminds us that it is possible.”

PAUL TOUGH, WHO GETS TO GRADUATE? THE NEW YORK TIMES, MAY 15, 2014
Do we actively bridge communities?

1. Does your organization’s racial equity goals address the individual, institutional, or structural level through which barriers to opportunity can occur?
   
   a. Do they address more than one level? Why or why not?

1. How do your organization’s racial equity goals align with the goals of local leaders, organizations, and institutions in the community you serve?

1. How do your organization’s racial equity goals align with and/or support the goals of others in the room working in different levers for change?
Expanding the circle of human concern requires:

EMPATHETIC SPACE
Focus on terms that unify people, rather than those that divide. Instead of an us/them mentality, focus on a “we.”

UNDERSTANDING OUR LINKED FATE
We are inextricably linked. We need to understand the effect structures have on all individuals.
Reconciling the gap between values and reality

Our Collective Work Must Be…

Transformative
- Create System Level Change
- Catalyze change
- Target Leverage Points
- Impact Cross-Domain/Sector/Issue

Power-Building
- Support Alliances
- Build Coalitions
- Broaden Stakeholders
- Build Movement

Narrative Changing
- Inspire Action
- Raise Consciousness
- Create Coherence Between Issues
How to make transformative change

- Transformative thinking and approaches to change should consider the structures that are creating and perpetuating disparities, and work to reform them for lasting change.

- Look at disaggregated data.

- The role of leadership in effecting transformative change is crucial. Policy is important, but only one piece of the puzzle. Language and narratives matter.

- Change our view and practice of leadership from transactional to transformative.
Action Steps

Actions: We must support efforts that advance the creation of inclusive and safe environments, including giving financial, political, institutional, and social support.

We commit to protecting and repairing the Earth from unalterable exploitation.

We prioritize protection and attention to groups who have been historically targeted, marginalized, and excluded; to those who seek refuge; and to those who become targets of attach or hate under and political administration or institution.
Action Steps, continued

We refuse to legitimize politics and policies based on hate, racism, albeism, sexism, Islamophobia, and expulsion, and we will resist all efforts to institutionalize them into policy, law, and culture.

We will take action when local, regional, or federal government actors, private businesses, or social movements ignore or violate the values in this compact, through dialogue, petitioning, boycotts, and nonviolent civil activities.

We embrace a shared, pluralist approach with those who share these values, and we will work with all who practice them in a spirit of mutual trust and respect, regardless of political affiliation.

Finally, we invite you to join our compact for a just and inclusive society at newsocialimpact.org
Responsibilities and Activities of Participants in a Network for Transformative Change

- Sharing information, best practices, and models
- Genuine capacity building
- Building institutional structures and support
- Building trust between communities and the institutions that serve them
Power Building: Developing Network Partnerships

1. Infrastructure and Structured Alliances
   • More than a coalition, but less than an organization.
   • A shared platform or structure that holds together and has the capacity to support and link critical interdisciplinary and inter-sector relationships.

1. Achieve Scale to Play Big
   • Tackle big issues/game changers.
   • Alignment: Bring together advocates, researchers, organizers, and policymakers.

3. Identify Strategic Partners and Expand Outward
   • Identify core groups. Grow in stages.
   • Legitimate and communicate community ambition.
   • Shared Governance: Participants contribute to and define the agenda.
Building equity & inclusivity takes time

Setting organizational goals and developing a common language and vocabulary for talking about race and identity is a necessary first step.

NEGATIVE FEEDBACK LOOPS

If two individuals are both anxious an interaction will be negative, it often is.

Both parties approach interaction with anxiety.  
Cognitive depletion leads to awkward interactions.  
Fears and stereotypes confirmed.

Difficult conversations will happen. We must learn how to be effective leaders and listeners in these conversations.
Closing Thoughts & Remarks

Addressing issues like climate change, poverty, health and disease, requires us to think about how we are all related and connected….how we structure our societies, policies, and practices, and how we can achieve our common goals in a way that acknowledges our deep connection to each other.
Q & A
Communicating Effectively on Race

Movements have narratives. They tell stories, because they are not just about rearranging economics and politics. They also rearrange meaning. And they're not just about redistributing the goods. They're about figuring out what is good.

— Marshall Ganz —
The role of narrative
The role of framing
What is framing?

*Networks of association that shape how we think, not just what we think*

- People reject facts that don’t fit their frames
- People carry multiple frames that are sometimes linked and sometimes contradictory.
- Framing is a long-term project because people need to receive it in multiple forms and over time to shift.
Framing and racial equity
Meta-frames on race and government

- Personal Responsibility
- Limited Government
Our frame

Advancing racial equity

Effective, inclusive democracy
Framing and messaging

• **Framing**
  • Comprehensive long term strategy

• **Messaging**
  • re-packaging arguments with language changes

• **Meta-Frames:** umbrella frames that encompass multiple values and symbols (e.g., individualism)
Framing and messaging

**Implicit Bias:**
Unconscious bias developed through networks of association on race

**Symbolic Racism:**
The use of images, code words, and metaphors that implicitly signal race

Using symbols to trigger unconscious racism

---


What we learned

• Framing matters – Attack the dominant race frames by pointing out inclusive values

• Effectively talking about race can move people on policy
In order to counter the race wedge, we must name race
Communicating about race:

Affirm

- Start with the heart
- Explain why we are all in this together

The health of our children, families, and loved ones depends on the environments in which we live.

People of all races want to live in clean environments with decent housing, good jobs, and high-quality schools.
For decades, low-income communities of color have been the dumping grounds for environmental hazards.

Having access to neighborhoods that support success shouldn't be determined by your race.
Transform

- Reframe winners and losers
- End with heart and a solution

Those that contaminate our environment need to be held accountable. For our collective good, we need to value the quality of all of our neighborhoods above the profits for a few.

Join me in supporting legislation that will bring accountability. Those that pollute need to pay their fair share so that all of us can have healthy environments in our communities.
Changing minds:

- Most importantly, the best way to change attitudes is to change behavior.
- Attitudinal change tends to follow behavior change.
- Requires both short and long-term approaches.
As leaders in progressive movements...

1. What is the social-political context for our roles as leaders for equity?
2. What is my personal experience with leading change toward equity?
3. How does my identity impact leading change, both within my organization and the larger community?
Sawubona
ZULU GREETING “WE SEE YOU”

1. An invitation to a deep witnessing and presence.
2. This greeting forms an agreement to affirm and investigate the mutual potential and obligation that is present in a given moment.

“Justice is the public face of love.”
A New Social Compact

http://newsocialcompact.org/

A belief in the rights of all people to fairly and freely participate in the democratic governing structures that impact their lives.

Read the full compact and sign on at newsocialcompact.org